

## FHS REVIEW 2024 2

### Comments to Editor:

All I can say is thank you to Reviewer 2 for some excellent insights about this poem, where it flourished and what was lacking; and thank you to the author for a truly creative, artistic, and emotionally powerful revision. I liked this poem the first time I read it, but now I love it. Please see Comments to Author for specifics as to why.

### Comments to Author:

Dear Author, what a beautiful poem you've created! I liked it quite a bit the first time around, but your revision (and the way you incorporated reviewer 2's insights) is truly masterful. Just to mention a few specifics: 1) Per reviewer's suggestion, the insertion and repetition of "just" really worked. It addressed the slight awkwardness of the construction (not how) while, importantly, underlining that the father taught valuable whistling skills but the deep meaning beneath the technique. 2) You solved the problem of the parentheses neatly and effectively. 3) the poem now has a very satisfying balance of lines opening each stanza - "My dad taught me..." and "When my dad died..." The parallelism is so effective because it also contains a heartbreaking evolution - from the loving, caring talented father to his loss. 4) You make excellent (and moving) use of parallel structure in stanzas 2 and 3, when you rely on the same construction of ears, mind, and heart, but skillfully change them to express your great grief and distress. 5) What is now the final stanza works perfectly - "song of resilience" is at once more joyful and less pretentious than "melody"; also glad to see the phrase "cacophony of emotions" go - in the previous stanza, you've done a superb job of showing that cacophony, no need to abstract it for the reader. 6) Per reviewer 2, losing the final stanza was inspired - this was a bit pollyannish, a bit over the top. Instead, you end with the most important thing - the whistle. The reader already understands everything you spelled out in the original final stanza.

In the final analysis, while this poem displays great craft and compositional care, what will stay with me is the care of this dad toward his child through his teaching; the child's honoring of this father through this poem; and the bond of timeless love between them created through whistling.